6.0: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter presents the study’s findings and conclusions for FDOT’s compensation and benefits program, and the Department’s Professional Engineer (P.E.) Training Program. The following sections also provide recommendations related to FDOT’s compensation system and P.E. Training Program.

6.1  SALARY RANGES

A detailed analysis was conducted of FDOT Management salaries and salary ranges utilizing a variety of data sources as detailed in Chapters 2.0 and 3.0. Key points from this analysis are summarized below.

- Overall, FDOT minimum and midpoint salary ranges fall below market standards, whereas maximum salary ranges fall high, indicating that the pay ranges are too wide and not reflective of the market in which FDOT operates.

- Relative to non-custom survey data reviewed for this study (excluding MGT’s customized salary survey and AASHTO salary survey), for the majority of classifications, FDOT annual salaries fall below those annual salary averages reported by market sources.

- The Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) data source provided the most full and comprehensive salary data for the majority of positions included in this study, thereby providing a high degree of validity and specificity. Analyses of this data source concluded that, in the southeast regional recruitment market, 43 percent of FDOT positions fell below BLS regional market* average salaries, ranging from 3.3 percent below to 34.2 percent below the market average. On a national level, 66 percent of FDOT positions fell below BLS national market average salaries, ranging from 0.1 percent below to 60.3 percent below the market average.

  *NOTE: BLS Regional recruitment market includes the following states, as data were available: Alabama, Arkansas, Georgia, Kentucky, Louisiana, Mississippi, North Carolina, South Carolina, Tennessee, Virginia, and West Virginia.

- Analysis of customized private transportation industry data collected from FDOT identified transportation industry peers, concluded that:
  - Relative to pay ranges, the minimum pay ranges for FDOT management positions fall well below transportation industry standards, ranging from 39.3 percent below to 68.5 percent below industry reported minimums.
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

FDOT midpoint salaries are also significantly below industry midpoint salaries. However, FDOT maximum salary ranges are significantly higher than industry maximums.

- Relative to annual average salaries, of the 24 FDOT positions included in the Transportation industry survey, nineteen (79.0%) fall below survey averages, ranging from .1 percent below market to 42.5 percent below market.

To provide competitive salary ranges into which executive level transportation staff can be recruited and retained, the following recommendations are offered in Exhibits 6-1a and 6-1b.
RECOMMENDATION 1(A)

Utilize a more customized salary range template (Exhibit 6-1) as a guide in hiring and promoting staff to more closely align to the transportation industry sector salaries. Note: regional BLS data were used to develop midpoints and ranges where custom survey data were not available.

(See Appendix M for a direct comparison of FDOT’s current broadband ranges to the proposed ranges presented below. Appendix N provides a grade assignment listing of FDOT positions and their placement within the proposed below pay schedule. Appendix O provides details on the data sources and benchmarked positions used for the pay scale and broadbands.)
## EXHIBIT 6-1a: SALARY RANGES BASED ON PRIVATE INDUSTRY MARKET

### Source: MGT of America, Inc., 2014.

Note: Benchmarks for BLS data for FDOT positions provided by the Florida Department of Management Services. 50% spread within ranges (25% above and below the midpoint). In some cases, the formula used to calculate the pay grade ranges resulted in maximum salaries that exceed the state’s mandated maximum salaries (includes broadband 20a, 20b, 23g, 24c, and 24d).

### BROADBAND | MINIMUM | MIDPOINT | MAXIMUM | ASSIGNED CLASSIFICATIONS
---|---|---|---|---
16 | $81,199.09 | $108,265.45 | $135,331.82 | ATTORNEY SUPERVISOR
20a | $71,843.18 | $95,790.91 | $119,738.64 | INVESTIGATION MANAGER - SES
20b | $77,955.68 | $103,940.91 | $129,926.14 | AUDIT DIRECTOR - SES; REGIO NAL MANAGER - DOT; MANAGER, FTRAFFIC O FICE - DOT
21a | $50,606.25 | $67,475.00 | $84,343.75 | AD MINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER; DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF FACILITIES & EQUIPMENT; DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF TOLL OPERATIONS; DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES; DISTRICT PLANNING & ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES MANAGER; DISTRICT PLANNING MANAGER - DOT; DISTRICT PROFESSIONAL SERVICES MANAGER; DISTRICT PROGRAMMG DIRECTOR - DOT; DISTRICT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION MANAGER - DOT; FEDERAL PROGRAM COORDINATOR - DOT; MANAGER, AVIATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTS ADMINISTRATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTUAL SERVICES OFFICE; MANAGER, EQUITY OPPORTUNITY OFFICE; MANAGER, FT Myers URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, RAIL OFFICE; MANAGER, SEAPORT OFFICE; MANAGER, STATEWIDE SCALE OPERATIONS; MANAGER, SYSTEMS PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, TRANSIT OFFICE; MANAGER, PENSACOLA URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; STATE SAFETY ADMINISTRATOR; STATE SURVEYOR - DOT; SUNPASS OPERATIONS MANAGER - DOT
21b | $72,487.79 | $96,650.39 | $120,812.98 | CHIEF LEGAL COUNSEL; DEPUTY COMPTROLLER, FINANCIAL ADMINISTRATION OFFICE; DEPUTY COMPTROLLER, GEN ACCOUNTING OFFICE-DOT; DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF FACILITIES & EQUIPMENT; DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF FLOOR OPERATIONS; DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES; DISTRICT PLANNING & ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES MANAGER; DISTRICT PLANNING MANAGER - DOT; DISTRICT PROFESSIONAL SERVICES MANAGER; DISTRICT PROGRAMMG DIRECTOR - DOT; DISTRICT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION MANAGER - DOT; FEDERAL PROGRAM COORDINATOR - DOT; MANAGER, AVIATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTS ADMINISTRATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTUAL SERVICES OFFICE; MANAGER, EQUITY OPPORTUNITY OFFICE; MANAGER, FT Myers URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, RAIL OFFICE; MANAGER, SEAPORT OFFICE; MANAGER, STATEWIDE SCALE OPERATIONS; MANAGER, SYSTEMS PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, TRANSIT OFFICE; MANAGER, PENSACOLA URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; STATE SAFETY ADMINISTRATOR; STATE SURVEYOR - DOT; SUNPASS OPERATIONS MANAGER - DOT
21c | $86,719.71 | $115,626.28 | $144,532.85 | DATA CENTER DIRECTOR - DOT; DISTRICT CONSTRUCTION ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT DESIGN ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT LAND SURVEYOR - DOT; DISTRICT MAINTENANCE ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT MATERIALS ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT TRAFFIC ENGINEER - DOT; MANAGER, BUSINESS SUPPORT; MANAGER, ENGINEERING/CAD SUPPORT; MANAGER, ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT OFFICE; MANAGER, PRODUCTION SUPPORT; MANAGER, SPECIFICATIONS & ESTIMATES OFFICE; MANAGER, STRATEGIC INITIATIVES; MANAGER, TRANSPORTATION STATISTICAL OFFICE; REGIONAL MGR FOR INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY; STATE ROADWAY DESIGN ENGINEER - DOT; STATE STRUCTURES DESIGN ENGINEER
22 | $73,086.75 | $97,449.00 | $121,811.25 | BUDGET OFFICER; DEPUTY GENERA L COUNSEL - DOT; PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER - DOT
23a | $78,651.20 | $104,868.27 | $131,085.33 | DIRECTOR, BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT & CONCESSION MANAGEMENT; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF MAINTENANCE; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF MATERIALS; LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS DIRECTOR; DIRECTOR OF THE OFFICE OF CONSTRUCTION - DOT; DIRECTOR OF THE OFFICE OF WORK PROGRAM & BUDGET; STATE HIGHWAY ENGINEER
23b | $94,073.50 | $125,431.33 | $156,789.17 | STATE HIGHWAY ENGINEER-DOT
23c | $101,601.16 | $135,468.22 | $169,335.27 | STATE HIGHWAY ENGINEER-DOT
23d | $109,324.50 | $145,766.00 | $182,207.50 | CMT PLANNING DIRECTOR
23e | $115,786.02 | $154,381.36 | $192,976.70 | CMT PLANNING DIRECTOR
23f | $125,277.38 | $167,036.50 | $208,795.63 | CMT PLANNING DIRECTOR
23g | $148,611.10 | $198,148.13 | $247,685.16 | CMT PLANNING DIRECTOR
24a | $92,105.40 | $122,807.20 | $153,509.00 | CMT PLANNING DIRECTOR
24b | $139,926.00 | $186,368.00 | $233,210.00 | ASSISTANT SECRETARY, ENGINEERING & OPERATIONS; ASSISTANT SECRETARY FOR FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION; ASSISTANT SECRETARY, INTERMODAL SYSTEMS DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR
24c* | $155,810.81 | $207,747.75 | $259,684.69 | EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, FLO RIDA RAIL ENTERPRISE; EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, FLO RIDA'S TURNPIKE ENTERPRISE
24d* | $171,408.28 | $228,544.38 | $285,680.47 | DISTRICT SECRETARY
25 | $156,154.02 | $208,205.36 | $260,256.70 | SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION

---

Florida Transportation Commission
Florida Department of Transportation Management Compensation Study
Chapter 6.0 6-4
RECOMMENDATION 1(B)

As an alternative to the ranges outlined in Exhibit 6-1a, utilize the salary range template (Exhibit 6-1b) developed through the use of regional BLS data only. While BLS data includes both public and private industry sources, these data reflect a wider range of data sources and higher number of position comparisons.

(See Appendix M for a direct comparison of FDOT’s current broadband ranges to the proposed ranges presented below. Appendix N provides a grade order listing of FDOT positions and their placement within the proposed below pay schedule. Appendix O provides details on the data sources and benchmarked positions used for the pay scale and broadbands.)
## Exhibit 6-1b: Salary Ranges Based on Regional Market

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Broadband</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Midpoint</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Assigned Classifications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>$81,199.09</td>
<td>$108,265.45</td>
<td>$135,331.82</td>
<td>Attorney Supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20a</td>
<td>$71,843.18</td>
<td>$95,790.91</td>
<td>$119,738.64</td>
<td>Investigator Manager - SES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20b</td>
<td>$77,955.68</td>
<td>$103,940.91</td>
<td>$129,926.14</td>
<td>Audit Director - R - SES; Regional Travel Agent - DOT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21a</td>
<td>$50,606.25</td>
<td>$67,475.00</td>
<td>$84,343.75</td>
<td>Administrative Services Manager - SES; Deputy Director, Support-TO-DOT; District Engineer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21b</td>
<td>$72,095.23</td>
<td>$96,126.97</td>
<td>$120,158.71</td>
<td>Chief Legal Counsel; Director of Human Resources; District Public Transportation Mgmt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21c</td>
<td>$80,293.93</td>
<td>$107,058.57</td>
<td>$133,823.21</td>
<td>Budget Officer; Deputy Director, District Planning &amp; Environment Mgmt; Data Center Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21d</td>
<td>$89,749.77</td>
<td>$119,666.36</td>
<td>$149,582.95</td>
<td>District Construction Engineer - DOT; District Design Engineer - DOT; District Surveyor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>$73,086.75</td>
<td>$97,449.00</td>
<td>$121,811.25</td>
<td>Budget Officer; Deputy General Counsel-DOT; Public Information Admistrato-DOT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23a</td>
<td>$79,866.82</td>
<td>$106,489.09</td>
<td>$133,111.36</td>
<td>Comptroller-DOT; Dir of the Office of Policy Planning-DOT; Director Office of Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23b</td>
<td>$87,378.51</td>
<td>$116,504.68</td>
<td>$145,630.85</td>
<td>Director of the Office of Design-N-DOT to-T - DOT; Director of the Office of Design-N-DOT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23c</td>
<td>$124,442.73</td>
<td>$165,923.64</td>
<td>$207,404.55</td>
<td>Chief Financial Officer-EOT-DOT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24a</td>
<td>$59,269.77</td>
<td>$79,026.36</td>
<td>$98,782.95</td>
<td>Assistant Sec., Engineering &amp; Operations, Asst Sec. Ret, Financ-E and Admin-DOT, Asst Sec</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24c*</td>
<td>$124,442.73</td>
<td>$165,923.64</td>
<td>$207,404.55</td>
<td>Chief of Staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>$138,131.43</td>
<td>$184,175.24</td>
<td>$230,219.05</td>
<td>Secretary of Transportation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MGT of America, Inc., 2014. Note: Benchmarks for BLS data for FDOT positions provided by the Florida Department of Management Services. 50% spread within ranges (25% above and below the midpoint). In some cases, the formula used to calculate the pay grade ranges resulted in maximum salaries that exceed the state’s mandated maximum salaries (includes broadband 20a and 20b). Broadband 25 adjusted upward by 11% for hierarchy and to adjust to state range. *This includes only one position, the Chief of Staff.
The revised broadbands were based on average actual salaries of benchmarked positions, and some of the positions with comparable average salaries were collapsed into the same broadband and the broadband was based on the benchmarks’ average salary (See Appendix O). Some of the benchmarks were excluded from the creation of the broadbands due to having outlier salaries. Given the nature of the market data used, and because many of the positions included in this study are held by a single incumbent, it can be assumed that some of the average salaries fall above or below the median due to seniority and longevity, which were not controlled variables in the available data sets.

For the pay grade ranges developed using BLS data, the BLS Regional data set was used as the primary public/private market data source. The Regional market data were selected over the National and State data sets to provide a more representative sample of FDOT’s recruitment market. The Regional data includes a broader range of comparable positions, and includes more public sector salaries, including those from other state Departments of Transportation.

In reviewing average salaries relevant to the FDOT Secretary of Transportation position (Exhibit 6-2), the current salary of the Transportation Secretary ($141,001) falls below all reported average salaries across markets.

**EXHIBIT 6-2: ANNUAL AVERAGE SALARY COMPARISONS - TRANSPORTATION SECRETARY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLASS TITLE</th>
<th>FDOT ANNUAL SALARY</th>
<th>BLS - REGIONAL (Excludes FL)</th>
<th>BLS - STATE</th>
<th>BLS - NATIONAL</th>
<th>PRIVATE INDUSTRY CUSTOMIZED SURVEY DATA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Secretary of Transportation</td>
<td>$141,001</td>
<td>$165,924</td>
<td>$196,200</td>
<td>$178,400</td>
<td>$208,205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Occupational Employment Statistics, Bureau of Labor Statistics, May 2013 data; MGT Customized Peer Salary Survey, 2014. Note: FDOT Annual Salary may reflect the last held annual salary by the previous incumbent for currently vacant classifications. BLS 2013 data have been aged for inflation for comparison to FDOT 2014 salary figures. BLS Regional salary figure reflects original benchmarked salary and not the adjusted figure $184,175 as shown in Exhibit 6-2.

**RECOMMENDATION 2**

Consider providing a significant salary increase to the Secretary of Transportation position. The FDOT Secretary’s salary is significantly below BLS and private industry reported salaries.

- **OPTION 1**: A salary increase of 48 percent would bring the Secretary’s salary to the private industry reported average salary of $208,205 (an increase of $67,204).

- **OPTION 2**: A salary increase of 31 percent would bring the Secretary’s salary to the regional reported average salary of $184,175 (an increase of $43,174).