

6.0: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter presents the study's findings and conclusions for FDOT's compensation and benefits program, and the Department's Professional Engineer (P.E.) Training Program. The following sections also provide recommendations related to FDOT's compensation system and P.E. Training Program.

6.1 SALARY RANGES

A detailed analysis was conducted of FDOT Management salaries and salary ranges utilizing a variety of data sources as detailed in **Chapters 2.0** and **3.0**. Key points from this analysis are summarized below.

- Overall, FDOT minimum and midpoint salary ranges fall below market standards, whereas maximum salary ranges fall high, indicating that the pay ranges are too wide and not reflective of the market in which FDOT operates.
- Relative to non-custom survey data reviewed for this study (excluding MGT's customized salary survey and AASHTO salary survey), for the majority of classifications, FDOT annual salaries fall below those annual salary averages reported by market sources.
- The Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) data source provided the most full and comprehensive salary data for the majority of positions included in this study, thereby providing a high degree of validity and specificity. Analyses of this data source concluded that, in the southeast regional recruitment market, 43 percent of FDOT positions fell below BLS regional market* average salaries, ranging from 3.3 percent below to 34.2 percent below the market average. On a national level, 66 percent of FDOT positions fell below BLS national market average salaries, ranging from 0.1 percent below to 60.3 percent below the market average.

**NOTE: BLS Regional recruitment market includes the following states, as data were available: Alabama, Arkansas, Georgia, Kentucky, Louisiana, Mississippi, North Carolina, South Carolina, Tennessee, Virginia, and West Virginia.*

- Analysis of customized private transportation industry data collected from FDOT identified transportation industry peers, concluded that:
 - Relative to pay ranges, the minimum pay ranges for FDOT management positions fall well below transportation industry standards, ranging from 39.3 percent below to 68.5 percent below industry reported minimums.

FDOT midpoint salaries are also significantly below industry midpoint salaries. However, FDOT maximum salary ranges are significantly higher than industry maximums.

- Relative to annual average salaries, of the 24 FDOT positions included in the Transportation industry survey, nineteen (79.0%) fall below survey averages, ranging from .1 percent below market to 42.5 percent below market.

To provide competitive salary ranges into which executive level transportation staff can be recruited and retained, the following recommendations are offered in **Exhibits 6-1a** and **6-1b**.

RECOMMENDATION 1(A)

Utilize a more customized salary range template (Exhibit 6-1) as a guide in hiring and promoting staff to more closely align to the transportation industry sector salaries Note: regional BLS data were used to develop midpoints and ranges where custom survey data were not available.

*(See **Appendix M** for a direct comparison of FDOT's current broadband ranges to the proposed ranges presented below. **Appendix N** provides a grade assignment listing of FDOT positions and their placement within the proposed below pay schedule.*

***Appendix O** provides details on the data sources and benchmarked positions used for the pay scale and broadbands.)*

EXHIBIT 6-1a: SALARY RANGES BASED ON PRIVATE INDUSTRY MARKET

BROADBAND	MINIMUM	MIDPOINT	MAXIMUM	ASSIGNED CLASSIFICATIONS
16	\$ 81,199.09	\$ 108,265.45	\$ 135,331.82	ATTORNEY SUPERVISOR
20a	\$ 71,843.18	\$ 95,790.91	\$ 119,738.64	INVESTIGATION MANAGER - SES
20b	\$ 77,955.68	\$ 103,940.91	\$ 129,926.14	AUDIT DIRECTOR - SES; REGIONAL TOLL MANAGER-DOT
21a	\$ 50,606.25	\$ 67,475.00	\$ 84,343.75	ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER; DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SUPPORT-DOT; DISTRICT RIGHT-OF-WAY ADMIN - DOT; MANAGER, RIGHT-OF-WAY OPERATIONS; MANAGER, RIGHT-OF-WAY PRODUCTION; MANAGER, SUPPORT SERVICES OFFICE; TURNPIKE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER
21b	\$ 72,487.79	\$ 96,650.39	\$ 120,812.98	CHIEF LEGAL COUNSEL; DEP COMPTROLLER, FINANCIAL ADMIN OFFICE; DEPUTY COMPT, DISBURSEMENT OPS OFC-DOT; DEPUTY COMPTROLLER, GEN ACCTNG OFFICE-DOT; DEPUTY DIR OF FACILITIES & EQUP-DOT; DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR TOLL OPERATIONS-DOT; DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES; DIST PLANNING & ENVIRONMNT MGT ADMIN-DOT; DISTRICT MAINTENANCE ADMINISTRATOR - SES; DISTRICT PLANNING MANAGER - DOT; DISTRICT PROFESSIONAL SERVICES ADMIN-DOT; DISTRICT PROGRAM MGMT ADMIN-DOT; DISTRICT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION MGR - DOT; FEDERAL PROGRAM COORDINATOR-DOT; MANAGER, AVIATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTS ADMINISTRATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTUAL SERVICES OFFICE; MANAGER, EQUAL OPPORTUNITY OFFICE; MANAGER, FT MYERS URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, RAIL OFFICE; MANAGER, SEAPORT OFFICE-DOT; MANAGER, STATEWIDE SCALE OPERATIONS; MANAGER, SYSTEMS PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, TRANSIT OFFICE; MANAGER, PENSACOLA URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; STATE SAFETY ADMINISTRATOR; STATE SURVEYOR-DOT; SUNPASS OPERATIONS MANAGER-DOT
21c	\$ 86,719.71	\$ 115,626.28	\$ 144,532.85	DATA CENTER DIRECTOR-DOT; DISTRICT CONSTRUCTION ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT DESIGN ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT LAND SURVEYOR - DOT; DISTRICT MAINTENANCE ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT MATERIALS ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT TRAFFIC OPERATIONS ENGINEER-DOT; MANAGER, BUSINESS SYSTEMS SUPPORT; MANAGER, ENGINEERING/CADD SYSTEMS DESIGN; MANAGER, ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT OFFICE; MANAGER, PRODUCTION SUPPORT OFFICE; MANAGER, SPECIFICATIONS & ESTIMATES OFFI; MANAGER, STRATEGIC INITIATIVES; MANAGER, TRANSPORTATION STATISTIC OFFICE; REGIONAL MGR FOR INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY; STATE ROADWAY DESIGN ENGINEER-DOT; STATE STRUCTURES DESIGN ENGINEER
22	\$ 73,086.75	\$ 97,449.00	\$ 121,811.25	BUDGET OFFICER; DEPUTY GENERAL COUNSEL-DOT; PUBLIC INFORMATION ADMINISTRATOR-DOT
23a	\$ 78,651.20	\$ 104,868.27	\$ 131,085.33	DIRECTOR, BUSINESS DEV & CONCESSION MGMT; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF MAINTENANCE; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF MATERIALS; LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS ADMINISTRATOR
23b	\$ 94,073.50	\$ 125,431.33	\$ 156,789.17	DIR OF THE OFFICE OF CONSTRUCTION-DOT; DIR OFFICE OF WORK PROGRAM & BUDGET; STATE FREIGHT & LOGISTICS ADMINISTRATOR; STATE TRAFFIC OPERATIONS ENGINEER; STATE TRANSPORTATION DEV ADMIN
23c	\$ 101,601.16	\$ 135,468.22	\$ 169,335.27	STATE HIGHWAY ENGINEER-DOT
23d	\$ 109,324.50	\$ 145,766.00	\$ 182,207.50	COMPTROLLER-DOT
23e	\$ 115,786.02	\$ 154,381.36	\$ 192,976.70	DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF INFORMATION SYSTEMS; DIRECTOR, TOLL OPERATIONS; DISTRICT DIRECTOR-OPERATIONS-DOT; DISTRICT DIRECTOR-PRODUCTION-DOT
23f	\$ 125,277.38	\$ 167,036.50	\$ 208,795.63	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER-DOT; DIR OF THE OFF OF POLICY PLANNING-DOT; DIRECTOR OF THE OFFICE OF DESIGN-DOT; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF RIGHT-OF-WAY
23g	\$ 148,611.10	\$ 198,148.13	\$ 247,685.16	GENERAL COUNSEL-DOT
24a	\$ 92,105.40	\$ 122,807.20	\$ 153,509.00	CHIEF OF STAFF; DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION; INSPECTOR GENERAL-DOT
24b	\$ 139,926.00	\$ 186,368.00	\$ 233,210.00	ASSISTANT SEC, ENGINEERING & OPERATIONS; ASST SECRETARY FOR FINANCE AND ADMIN-DOT; ASST SECRETARY, INTERMODAL SYSTEMS DEV
24c*	\$ 155,810.81	\$ 207,747.75	\$ 259,684.69	EXEC DIR, FLORIDA RAIL ENTERPRISE; EXEC DIR, FLORIDA'S TURNPIKE ENTERPRISE
24d*	\$ 171,408.28	\$ 228,544.38	\$ 285,680.47	DISTRICT SECRETARY
25	\$ 156,154.02	\$ 208,205.36	\$ 260,256.70	SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION

Source: MGT of America, Inc., 2014. Note: Benchmarks for BLS data for FDOT positions provided by the Florida Department of Management Services 50% spread within ranges (25% above and below the midpoint). In some cases, the formula used to calculate the pay grade ranges resulted in maximum salaries that exceed the state's mandated maximum salaries (includes broadbands 20a, 20b, 23g, 24c, and 24d).

RECOMMENDATION 1(B)

As an alternative to the ranges outlined in Exhibit 6-1a, utilize the salary range template (Exhibit 6-1b) developed through the use of regional BLS data only. While BLS data includes both public and private industry sources, these data reflect a wider range of data sources and higher number of position comparisons.

*(See **Appendix M** for a direct comparison of FDOT's current broadband ranges to the proposed ranges presented below. **Appendix N** provides a grade order listing of FDOT positions and their placement within the proposed below pay schedule. **Appendix O** provides details on the data sources and benchmarked positions used for the pay scale and broadbands.)*

EXHIBIT 6-1b: SALARY RANGES BASED ON REGIONAL MARKET

BROADBAND	MINIMUM	MIDPOINT	MAXIMUM	ASSIGNED CLASSIFICATIONS
16	\$ 81,199.09	\$ 108,265.45	\$ 135,331.82	ATTORNEY SUPERVISOR
20a	\$ 71,843.18	\$ 95,790.91	\$ 119,738.64	INVESTIGATION MANAGER - SES
20b	\$ 77,955.68	\$ 103,940.91	\$ 129,926.14	AUDIT DIRECTOR - SES; REGIONAL TOLL MANAGER-DOT
21a	\$ 50,606.25	\$ 67,475.00	\$ 84,343.75	ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER; DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SUPPORT-DOT; DISTRICT RIGHT-OF-WAY ADMIN - DOT; MANAGER, RIGHT-OF-WAY OPERATIONS; MANAGER, RIGHT-OF-WAY PRODUCTION; MANAGER, SUPPORT SERVICES OFFICE; TURNPIKE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER
21b	\$ 72,095.23	\$ 96,126.97	\$ 120,158.71	CHIEF LEGAL COUNSEL; DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES; DIST PLANNING & ENVIRONMENT MGT ADMIN-DOT; DISTRICT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION MGR - DOT; FEDERAL PROGRAM COORDINATOR-DOT; MANAGER, AVIATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTS ADMINISTRATION OFFICE; MANAGER, CONTRACTUAL SERVICES OFFICE; MANAGER, FT MYERS URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, RAIL OFFICE; MANAGER, SEAPORT OFFICE-DOT; MANAGER, SYSTEMS PLANNING OFFICE; MANAGER, TRANSIT OFFICE; MANAGER, PENSACOLA URBAN PLANNING OFFICE; STATE SAFETY ADMINISTRATOR
21c	\$ 80,293.93	\$ 107,058.57	\$ 133,823.21	DATA CENTER DIRECTOR-DOT; DEP COMPTROLLER, FINANCIAL ADMIN OFFICE; DEPUTY COMPT, DISBURSEMENT OPS OFC-DOT; DEPUTY COMPTROLLER, GEN ACCTNG OFFICE-DOT; DEPUTY DIR OF FACILITIES & EQUIPT-DOT; DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR TOLL OPERATIONS-DOT; DISTRICT MAINTENANCE ADMINISTRATOR - SES; DISTRICT PLANNING MANAGER - DOT; DISTRICT PROFESSIONAL SERVICES ADMIN-DOT; DISTRICT PROGRAM MGMT ADMIN-DOT; MANAGER, BUSINESS SYSTEMS SUPPORT; MANAGER, ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT OFFICE; MANAGER, EQUAL OPPORTUNITY OFFICE; MANAGER, STATEWIDE SCALE OPERATIONS; MANAGER, TRANSPORTATION STATISTIC OFFICE; REGIONAL MGR FOR INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY; SUNPASS OPERATIONS MANAGER-DOT
21d	\$ 89,749.77	\$ 119,666.36	\$ 149,582.95	DISTRICT CONSTRUCTION ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT DESIGN ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT LAND SURVEYOR - DOT; DISTRICT MAINTENANCE ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT MATERIALS ENGINEER - DOT; DISTRICT TRAFFIC OPERATIONS ENGINEER-DOT; MANAGER, ENGINEERING/CADD SYSTEMS DESIGN; MANAGER, PRODUCTION SUPPORT OFFICE; MANAGER, SPECIFICATIONS & ESTIMATES OFFI; MANAGER, STRATEGIC INITIATIVES; STATE ROADWAY DESIGN ENGINEER-DOT; STATE STRUCTURES DESIGN ENGINEER; STATE SURVEYOR-DOT
22	\$ 73,086.75	\$ 97,449.00	\$ 121,811.25	BUDGET OFFICER; DEPUTY GENERAL COUNSEL-DOT; PUBLIC INFORMATION ADMINISTRATOR -DOT
23a	\$ 79,866.82	\$ 106,489.09	\$ 133,111.36	COMPTROLLER-DOT; DIR OF THE OFF OF POLICY PLANNING-DOT; DIR OFFICE OF WORK PROGRAM & BUDGET; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF INFORMATION SYSTEMS; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF RIGHT-OF-WAY; DIRECTOR, TOLL OPERATIONS; DISTRICT DIRECTOR-OPERATIONS-DOT; DISTRICT DIRECTOR-PRODUCTION-DOT; GENERAL COUNSEL-DOT; LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS ADMINISTRATOR; STATE FREIGHT & LOGISTICS ADMINISTRATOR; STATE TRANSPORTATION DEV ADMIN
23b	\$ 87,378.51	\$ 116,504.68	\$ 145,630.85	DIR OF THE OFFICE OF CONSTRUCTION-DOT; DIRECTOR OF THE OFFICE OF DESIGN-DOT; DIRECTOR, BUSINESS DEV & CONCESSION MGMT; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF MAINTENANCE; DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF MATERIALS; STATE HIGHWAY ENGINEER-DOT; STATE TRAFFIC OPERATIONS ENGINEER
23c	\$ 124,442.73	\$ 165,923.64	\$ 207,404.55	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER-DOT
24a	\$ 59,269.77	\$ 79,026.36	\$ 98,782.95	DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
24b	\$ 77,955.68	\$ 103,940.91	\$ 129,926.14	ASSISTANT SEC, ENGINEERING & OPERATIONS; ASST SECRETARY FOR FINANCE AND ADMIN-DOT; ASST SECRETARY, INTERMODAL SYSTEMS DEV; DISTRICT SECRETARY; EXEC DIR, FLORIDA RAIL ENTERPRISE; EXEC DIR, FLORIDA'S TURNPIKE ENTERPRISE; INSPECTOR GENERAL-DOT
24c*	\$ 124,442.73	\$ 165,923.64	\$ 207,404.55	CHIEF OF STAFF
25	\$ 138,131.43	\$ 184,175.24	\$ 230,219.05	SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION

Source: MGT of America, Inc., 2014. Note: Benchmarks for BLS data for FDOT positions provided by the Florida Department of Management Services. 50% spread within ranges (25% above and below the midpoint). In some cases, the formula used to calculate the pay grade ranges resulted in maximum salaries that exceed the state's mandated maximum salaries (includes broadband 20a and 20b). Broadband 25 adjusted upward by 11% for hierarchy and to adjust to state range. *This includes only one position, the Chief of Staff.

The revised broadbands were based on average actual salaries of benchmarked positions, and some of the positions with comparable average salaries were collapsed into the same broadband and the broadband was based on the benchmarks' average salary (See **Appendix O**). Some of the benchmarks were excluded from the creation of the broadbands due to having outlier salaries. Given the nature of the market data used, and because many of the positions included in this study are held by a single incumbent, it can be assumed that some of the average salaries fall above or below the median due to seniority and longevity, which were not controlled variables in the available data sets.

For the pay grade ranges developed using BLS data, the BLS Regional data set was used as the primary public/private market data source. The Regional market data were selected over the National and State data sets to provide a more representative sample of FDOT's recruitment market. The Regional data includes a broader range of comparable positions, and includes more public sector salaries, including those from other state Departments of Transportation.

In reviewing average salaries relevant to the FDOT Secretary of Transportation position (**Exhibit 6-2**), the current salary of the Transportation Secretary (\$141,001) falls below all reported average salaries across markets.

EXHIBIT 6-2: ANNUAL AVERAGE SALARY COMPARISONS – TRANSPORTATION SECRETARY

CLASS TITLE	FDOT ANNUAL SALARY	AVERAGE SALARY BY DATA SOURCE			
		BLS - REGIONAL (Excludes FL)	BLS - STATE	BLS - NATIONAL	PRIVATE INDUSTRY CUSTOMIZED SURVEY DATA
Secretary of Transportation	\$ 141,001	\$ 165,924	\$ 196,200	\$ 178,400	\$ 208,205

Sources: Occupational Employment Statistics, Bureau of Labor Statistics, May 2013 data; MGT Customized Peer Salary Survey, 2014. Note: FDOT Annual Salary may reflect the last held annual salary by the previous incumbent for currently vacant classifications. BLS 2013 data have been aged for inflation for comparison to FDOT 2014 salary figures. BLS Regional salary figure reflects original benchmarked salary and not the adjusted figure \$184,175 as shown in **Exhibit 6-2**.

RECOMMENDATION 2

Consider providing a significant salary increase to the Secretary of Transportation position. The FDOT Secretary's salary is significantly below BLS and private industry reported salaries.

- **OPTION 1:** A salary increase of 48 percent would bring the Secretary's salary to the private industry reported average salary of \$208,205 (an increase of \$67,204).
- **OPTION 2:** A salary increase of 31 percent would bring the Secretary's salary to the regional reported average salary of \$184,175 (an increase of \$43,174).